REGIONAL TRENDS IN DIAGENESIS AND RESERVOIR QUALITY OF JURASSIC COTTON VALLEY SANDSTONES, NORTHERN GULF OF MEXICO BASIN

Shirley P. Dutton, William A. Ambrose, Bohdan B. Horodecky, and Robert G. Loucks
Bureau of Economic Geology, Jackson School of Geosciences, University of Texas at Austin, University Station, Box X, Austin, Texas 78713–8924, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT

Jurassic Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi were deposited in shallow-marine and fluvial depositional environments in the northern Gulf of Mexico Basin. Reservoir quality of onshore Cotton Valley sandstones varies significantly across this area, increasing from west to east, despite greater eastern burial depths. Petrographic analysis was conducted to determine the influence of detrital composition, texture, and diagenesis on reservoir quality. The objective of this study was to determine the controls on reservoir quality in onshore Cotton Valley sandstones from East Texas to Mississippi.

Cotton Valley sandstones are mostly subarkoses and sublitharenites and have an average composition of 85.5% quartz, 8.5% feldspar, and 6.0% rock fragments (Q 85.5F8.5R6.0). Metamorphic rock fragments are the most common lithic grains. Sandstones in East Texas contain fewer rock fragments (Q 88.1F9.9R2.0) compared with Mississippi (Q77.0F10.5R12.5). Cotton Valley average grain size increases from west to east.

Total volume of cements and replacement minerals ranges between 0 and 48.0% in the Cotton Valley sandstones analyzed. Chlorite and illite form partial to complete clay rims around some detrital grains in Cotton Valley sandstones. In shallow-marine sandstones from East Texas and Louisiana, clay rims are discontinuous and cover only a small percentage of the grains. Abundant quartz cement precipitated where clay-rim coverage was low. Some Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi contain continuous clay rims that inhibited later quartz cementation and preserved intergranular porosity in fluvial and shallow-marine sandstones. Average porosity is higher in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi (15.7%) than it is in East Texas (5.7%) or Louisiana (4.4%). Geometric mean permeability is also higher in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi (7.3 md) than it is in sandstones from East Texas (0.02 md) or Louisiana (0.06 md). Unconfined compressive strength (UCS) of Cotton Valley sandstones and mudstones was estimated using a rebound hammer. There is a statistically significant correlation between total volume of cement in Cotton Valley samples and UCS.

Vitrinite reflectance equivalent (Roe), an estimate of thermal maturity, was calculated by burial-history modeling. Roe is lowest for onshore Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi (1.05%) and increases westward to 1.2% in Louisiana and 1.4% in East Texas. Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi are buried to greater depths than those in Texas and Louisiana, but because the geothermal gradient is lower in Mississippi, thermal maturity is less than in Texas and Louisiana.

Reservoir quality of onshore Mississippi Cotton Valley sandstones is superior to that of Texas and Louisiana as a result of several factors: coarser grain size, more continuous clay rims on detrital grains, and lower geothermal gradient. This study of diagenesis of onshore Cotton Valley sandstones provides insight into reservoir quality of Cotton Valley sandstones in the northeastern Gulf of Mexico. Low porosity and high thermal maturity in offshore Cotton Valley sandstones in the northeastern Gulf of Mexico indicate that generally poor reservoir quality exists in this area.

INTRODUCTION

Sandstones of the Upper Jurassic Cotton Valley Group represent a major progradation of terrigenous clastics into the north-
Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana, despite being buried to greater depths, as described in the ‘Burial-History Modeling’ section herein. The Cotton Valley was designated a tight gas formation in most of East Texas and Louisiana by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission, having average in situ permeability throughout the pay section of 0.1 md or less (Dutton et al., 1993). In contrast, permeability in Cotton Valley oil and gas reservoirs in Mississippi ranges up to 500 md (Bebout et al., 1992).

In this study we characterize regional variation of detrital mineral composition, diagenesis, and reservoir quality of Cotton Valley sandstones from East Texas to Mississippi in order to identify the main controls on reservoir quality. Previous petrographic studies of the Cotton Valley sandstones have mainly investigated individual fields or specific areas (e.g., Wescott, 1983; Russell et al., 1984; Janks et al., 1985; Dutton et al., 1991). More recently, a regional analysis of diagenesis of Cotton Valley sandstones was conducted by Thomas et al. (2004, 2005). Our investigation builds on those previous studies. Petrographic and reservoir-quality data were collected from 12 wells in East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi (Fig. 1), from samples buried to depths of 8716 to 14,792 ft (2656 to 4508 m) and temperatures of 228 to 334°F (109 to 167°C). The goals of the project were to determine the controls on regional trends in diagenesis and reservoir quality in onshore Cotton Valley sandstones and to assess reservoir potential of Cotton Valley sandstones in the northeastern Gulf of Mexico.

GEOLOGIC SETTING

Cotton Valley cores from East Texas and northern Louisiana used in this study (Fig. 1) are located in the Terryville Bar and Poole Sand trends (Coleman and Coleman, 1981; Ewing, 2001; see Ambrose et al., 2017, this volume, their figure 1) and represent a suite of shallow-marine facies within a wave-dominated depositional setting. These shallow-marine facies include lower- and upper-shoreface, beach, tidal-inlet, washover-fan, and destructive-beach deposits associated with transgression and relative sea-level rise (Ambrose et al., 2017, this volume). Cotton Valley cores from Mississippi, which are located in an off-axis area of the ancestral Mississippi Delta, display a variety of fluvial channel-fill and muddy floodplain facies (Ambrose et al., 2017, this volume). Shallow-marine depositional systems are also represented. These shallow-marine deposits are composed almost entirely of aggradational, sandy upper-shoreface facies. The southeast-oriented trend of shallow-water Cotton Valley deposits in Mississippi is interpreted to extend into the northeastern Gulf of Mexico (Thomas et al., 2005), where they were cored in Viosca Knoll Block 251 (Fig. 1).

Most Cotton Valley sandstones in this study were deposited in early Cotton Valley (Tithonian) time. The Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas were sourced from the Ouachita Mountains and Arbuckle Uplift to the northwest (Coleman, 1985; Wescott, 1983, 1985; Ewing, 2001; Elshayeb, 2004), whereas those in east-central Mississippi were derived from the Appalachian

Figure 1. Location of wells used in study of Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi. Thin-section samples were available from all onshore wells except the Shell #2 Fender; only core-analysis data were available from that well. A burial-history model was made for the offshore Exxon #1 SL 00624 well, but no samples or core-analysis data were available. Cotton Valley sandstones cored in the Chevron #1 Viosca Knoll 251 well are discussed in Thomas et al. (2004, 2005).
drainage systems to the northeast and east (Moore, 1983; Ewing, 2001; Thomas et al., 2004). Cotton Valley sandstones in northern Louisiana are interpreted as being strike-fed from the west (Coleman and Coleman, 1981; Ewing, 2001). Two cores of upper Cotton Valley sandstones deposited during Tithonian-Berriasian time are included in this study. They are from the Shell #1 Fender and the Southwest Gas #1 Richardson wells in Mississippi (Fig. 1), and the source area for these Cotton Valley sandstones is interpreted as being the Appalachians as well (Moore, 1983; Ewing, 2001).

METHODS

Composition of Cotton Valley sandstones was determined by standard thin-section petrography. Point counts were completed on 103 thin sections of sandstones and mudstones from 11 wells (Fig. 1). Of those samples, 84 are sandstones that contain <10% detrital clay matrix, with the remainder being muddy sandstones (15) and sandy mudstones (4) (terminology of Folk [1974]). A total of 200 counts were made on each thin section. Counting error varies with the percentage of the constituent. A constituent that composes 50% of the sample has an error of ±3.6%, whereas a constituent that is 10% has an error of ±2.1%, and one that is 2% of the sample has an error of ±0.9% (Folk, 1974). Grain size and sorting were determined by measuring the long diameter of 100 competent grains (quartz and feldspar) per thin section. Rock strength (unconfined compressive strength, UCS) of Cotton Valley sandstones and mudstones was estimated from hardness data collected on cores using an Equotip™ (Proceq, 2017).

Temperature for each thin-section sample was calculated by the following three-step procedure: (1) correct bottom-hole temperatures from geophysical logs from each well using the time-since-circulation correction (Waples et al., 2004; Corrigan, 2006), (2) calculate geothermal gradient for each well, and (3) use the geothermal gradient from the appropriate logging run to calculate temperature at the depth of each thin-section core analysis sample. Bottom-hole temperature corrections were done using the time-since-circulation correction found at the following website: http://zetaware.com/utilities/bht/timesince.html.

Mean annual surface temperature, which was used to calculate temperature at depth, ranges from 62 to 67.4°F (16.7 to 19.7°C) in the study area (U.S. Climate Data, 2016). Calculated geothermal gradients in wells used in this study range from 1.33 to 2.04°F/100 ft (24.2 to 37.2°C/km), and calculated subsurface temperatures of the samples range from 228 to 334°F (109 to 167°C). Cotton Valley sandstones in the study area are likely to be at or near their maximum burial depth and temperature now.

Core-analysis data were available from 214 samples of Cotton Valley sandstones from 10 of the wells (Fig. 1). Porosity and permeability were measured at unstressed conditions (800 psi [5.5 MPa]) by routine core analysis of plugs cut from conventional cores. Permeability was measured to air.

Burial-history models of 3 wells from the onshore Gulf of Mexico, in Texas (Mobil #15 Cargill), Louisiana (Amoco #1 Davis), and Mississippi (Shell #1 Fender) (Fig. 1), were created using the program Genesis 5.34 (ZetaWare, 2009) to characterize burial history of onshore Cotton Valley sandstones. A model also generated to characterize the burial history of Cotton Valley sandstones on the Gulf of Mexico shelf in offshore Alabama (Exxon #1 SL 00624 well) (Fig. 1). Values of vitrinite reflectance equivalent (Rₑₑ), an indicator of thermal maturity, were calculated in the burial-history models using the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (LLNL) vitrinite maturation model (Sweeney and Burnham, 1990). Comparing Rₑₑ values of sandstones from these different areas provides an indication of relative thermal maturity of Cotton Valley sandstones in the northern Gulf of Mexico.

RESULTS

Petrographic properties of Cotton Valley sandstones, including grain size, detrital mineral composition, and diagenesis, vary across the study area. Reservoir quality also varies across the study area and generally increases from west to east.

Texture

Cotton Valley sandstones that contain <10% clay matrix have a wide range of mean grain sizes, from lower very fine- to lower medium-grained sandstone. Average grain size of competent grains increases from west to east. Mean grain size of Cotton Valley sandstones is 3.30 phi (0.102 mm) in East Texas, 2.76 phi (0.148 mm) in Louisiana, and 2.20 phi (0.218 mm) in Mississippi (Table 1). Most Cotton Valley sandstones are well sorted (0.35 to 0.5 phi standard deviation) to moderately well sorted (0.50 to 0.71 phi standard deviation), as defined by Folk (1974).

Framework Grain Composition

Cotton Valley sandstones are mostly subarkoses and sublitharenites (sandstone classification of Folk [1974]) (Fig. 2). Average composition is 85.5% quartz, 8.5% feldspar, and 6.0% rock fragments (Q85.5F8.5R6.0). Detrital quartz is the most abundant mineral. Plagioclase is more abundant than potassium.

Table 1. Comparison of Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi; values are averages for each area. Average depths of the petrographic samples from each of the three study areas are rounded to the nearest 100 ft (30.5 m). Well locations shown in Figure 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>East Texas</th>
<th>Louisiana</th>
<th>Mississippi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grain size (mm)</td>
<td>0.102</td>
<td>0.148</td>
<td>0.218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>Q87.4F10.3R2.3</td>
<td>Q87.4F10.3R2.3</td>
<td>Q77.1F10.3R12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quartz cement (%)</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authigenic carbonate (%)</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary porosity (%)</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary porosity (%)</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microporosity (%)</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core-analysis porosity (%)</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>15.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geometric mean permeability (md)</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average depth (ft [m])</td>
<td>9200 [2804]</td>
<td>10,400 [3170]</td>
<td>14,300 [4359]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of samples</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
feldspar in the study area. Plagioclase composes an average of 3.4% of the whole-rock volume of Cotton Valley sandstones now, whereas orthoclase composes 2.3% and microcline, 0.1%.

Lithic grains in the Cotton Valley sandstones include metamorphic, sedimentary, and plutonic rock fragments. Metamorphic rock fragments (MRF) are the most common lithic grains in these Cotton Valley sandstones (Fig. 3), followed by sedimentary rock fragments (SRF), mainly chert. Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas contain the fewest rock fragments (Q88.1F9.9R2.0), whereas those in Mississippi contain the highest proportion (Q77.0F10.5R12.5) (Table 1). The trend of decreasing quartz and increasing MRF content in Cotton Valley sandstones from East Texas to Mississippi was reported by Thomas et al. (2005). Biotite and muscovite grains are rare across the study area, each having an average volume of 0.04%. The only other detrital framework grains are heavy minerals, including zircon, tourmaline, and opaque grains that are probably magnetite and/or ilmenite. Average volume of heavy minerals is 0.3%.

Cotton Valley sandstones were cored in an offshore well in the northeastern Gulf of Mexico, in Viosca Knoll Block 251 (Fig. 1) at a depth of 20,500 ft (6250 m) (Thomas et al., 2005). These Cotton Valley sandstones are lithic arkoses that contain abundant MRFs, mainly schist fragments, as well as grains of biotite and muscovite (Thomas et al., 2004, 2005). The composition of Cotton Valley sandstones in Viosca Knoll is similar to that observed in east-central Mississippi, reflecting the Appalachian provenance for sandstones in both areas.

Matrix

Detrital clay matrix in Cotton Valley sandstones and mudstones sampled in this study constitutes between 0 and 81% of the whole-rock volume. X–ray diffraction analysis (XRD) of five burrowed tidal-channel sandstones from the Mobil #4 McLofflin well in Harrison County, Texas (Fig. 1) determined that clays constitute from 3 to 6% by weight of the bulk-rock composition. Within the <2 micron fraction, illite composes 57 to 81%, chlorite composes 7 to 29%, and illite-smectite (having 20% smectite layers) composes 1 to 23%. Petrographic analysis indicates that the clays in these samples are mostly detrital, not authigenic.

Cements/Diagenetic History

Cements and replacement minerals compose between 0 and 48.0% of the whole-rock volume of Cotton Valley sandstones that contain <10% clay matrix, with an average volume of 23.7%. Quartz is the most abundant authigenic mineral (average whole-rock volume = 11.7%), followed by carbonates (calcite, Fe–calcite, and ankerite; 9.6%). Other authigenic minerals, which are generally present in minor volumes, include illite, chlorite, kaolinite, pyrite, albite, siderite, and sphene.

On the basis of petrographic evidence, the relative order of occurrence of the major events in the diagenetic history of Cotton Valley sandstones is: (1) mechanical compaction by grain rearrangement and deformation of ductile grains, (2) formation of chlorite and illite rims, (3) precipitation of early calcite cement and grain replacement, (4) precipitation of quartz overgrowths, (5) precipitation of Fe–calcite cement and grain replacement, (6) dissolution of potassium feldspar and albition of plagioclase, and (7) precipitation of ankerite cement and grain replacement. This sequence is similar to what has been interpreted in previous studies of Cotton Valley diagenesis (Wescott, 1983, 1985; Dutton et al., 1991, 1993; Elshayeb, 2004).

Compaction

Compaction caused significant porosity reduction in the majority of samples. Mechanical compaction took place both by rearrangement of mechanically stable grains, such as quartz and feldspar, and deformation of ductile grains, such as mud clasts,
micas, and MRFs (Fig. 3). Chemical compaction by quartz dissolution and grain interpenetration was less common but also reduced porosity in some samples by causing closer packing of framework grains (Bjørkum, 1996; Bloch et al., 2002). Intergranular volume (IGV) in Cotton Valley sandstones calculated by the method of Houseknecht (1987) (intergranular porosity + cement) averages 22.4%. Intergranular volume calculated by the method of Paxton et al. (2002), with matrix included (intergranular porosity + cement + depositional matrix), averages 23.8%.

**Chlorite and Illite Rims**

Chlorite and illite form partial to complete clay rims coating some detrital grains in Cotton Valley sandstones (Figs. 4 and 5). The clays that compose these rims are generally oriented parallel to the underlying detrital grains (Fig. 6). These clays may include inherited clay rims that were present on the grains when they were deposited (Wilson, 1992), infiltrated clays that formed after deposition (Bloch et al., 2002), and clay precursors such as berthierine or odinite (Worden and Morad, 2003) that formed
where amorphous iron hydroxides carried in river water flocculated when mixed with seawater (Ehrenberg, 1993; Bloch et al., 2002). Precursor clay flakes may cover grains by mechanical accretion as the grains are rolled around by currents. Early, parallel-oriented clay crystals that formed as clay-mineral precursors were later altered to illite or chlorite during burial diagenesis, and additional illite and chlorite flakes precipitated during burial diagenesis (Fig. 6).

The percentage of clay coverage on detrital grains was not quantified, but in general clay rims in Cotton Valley sandstones in Texas and Louisiana are less extensive than those in Mississippi. Many grains in Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana completely lack clay rims, and clay coverage is estimated as less than 30% on grains that do have partial rims (Fig. 4). Abundant quartz cement precipitated where clay rims were absent (Fig. 4). In contrast, more grains in Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi contain clay rims, and coverage on some grains is estimated as >70% (Fig. 5). These more continuous clay rims inhibited later quartz cementation and preserved intergranular porosity, although some quartz over-
growths were able to nucleate at gaps in the clay rims (Fig. 5). Clay rims on Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi are composed mainly of chlorite flakes that are oriented parallel to the detrital grains, but there are illite fibers on the grains as well (Fig. 6).

Clay rims are abundant in Cotton Valley samples from the Southwest Gas #1 Richardson and the Shell #1 Fender wells in Mississippi (Fig. 1). However, Cotton Valley samples from the Pan American #3 Williamson well (Fig. 1) in Mississippi lack extensive clay rims and contain abundant quartz cement. These quartz-cemented sandstones in the #3 Williamson well are similar to Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana.

Chlorite coats were observed on Cotton Valley sand grains in the Viosca Knoll Block 251 #1 well (Thomas et al., 2004, 2005). Chlorite-coat coverage in the Viosca Knoll sandstones averages 30% throughout the cored interval but ranges from 3% to 90% (Thomas et al., 2004). Thomas et al. (2005) interpreted the chlorite cement in Cotton Valley sandstones from the Viosca Knoll Block 251 #1 well as having formed by dissolution of detrital biotite derived from the Appalachian tectonic front. This
might not explain the origin of chlorite cement observed in Cotton Valley sandstones from onshore Mississippi, however. These onshore Mississippi sandstones were sourced by the ancestral Mississippi River (Ewing, 2001), but they do not contain a greater volume of detrital biotite (average = 0.04%) than Cotton Valley sandstones in either East Texas (0.06%) or Louisiana (0.04%).

Nevertheless, clay rims may be more abundant and continuous in Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi than in East Texas and Louisiana because of the difference in provenance, as suggested by Thomas et al. (2004). Weathering of iron-bearing metamorphic rock fragments and other iron-bearing minerals in the Appalachian Mountains may have contributed amorphous iron hydroxides to the Ancestral Mississippi fluvial system. The iron was carried by the river to the shallow-marine environment, where it could have formed clay precursors on sand grains (Land and Dutton, 1978; Ehrenberg, 1993; Grigsby, 2001; Bloch et al., 2002; Byrne et al., 2011). Continuous clay rims that occur in fluvial Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi may have formed by a similar process, or they may be a product of early mechanical infiltration (Moraes and De Ros, 1990).

Authigenic Quartz
Quartz is the most abundant cement in clean Cotton Valley sandstones, having an average volume of 11.7% and ranging in volume from 0 to 24%. The average volume of quartz cement is 9.9% in East Texas, 16.1% in Louisiana and 9.5% in Mississippi (Table 1). Cotton Valley sandstones have a wide range of quartz-cement volume, even in samples from the same well. Some of the samples with low volumes of quartz cement contain continuous clay rims (Fig. 6), whereas others are tightly cemented by early authigenic carbonate (Fig. 7) or contain abundant matrix and rock fragments.

Authigenic Carbonate
Calcite, Fe–calcite, and ankerite are the main authigenic carbonate minerals in Cotton Valley sandstones, although minor volumes of dolomite and siderite occur as well. Calcite and Fe–calcite occur in primary, intergranular pores (Fig. 7) and as grain replacements of unstable grains, mainly feldspars. Ankerite most commonly occurs as a grain-replacement mineral, particularly of feldspar, but some is also present in primary pores. The average total volume of carbonate cement and grain replacement in Cotton Valley sandstones is 9.6%, as determined by thin-section point counts. Of that, an average of 5.8% is primary pore-filling cement and 3.8% is grain replacement. Nearly 20% of the Cotton Valley sandstone samples contain significant volume (>25% whole-rock volume) of carbonate cement.

Authigenic carbonate in Cotton Valley sandstones is most abundant in East Texas (average volume 12.4%), with lower average volumes in Louisiana (9.5%) and Mississippi (5.1%) (Table 1). The volume of authigenic carbonate varies with depositional environment. Authigenic carbonate is most abundant in tidal-channel deposits (12.9%) and lower-shoreface deposits (average 10.6%). Authigenic carbonate is less common in fluvial-channel (9.2%), upper-shoreface (6.6%), and beach/upper-shoreface (3.4%) deposits.

Porosity
Total thin-section porosity (primary + secondary porosity) averages 4.0% and ranges from 0 to 21.5% in sandstones that contain <10% matrix. Average primary porosity is 2.8% and
ranges from 0 to 20%. Average secondary porosity is 1.2% and ranges from 0 to 4%. Primary porosity is higher in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi (average 7.7%) than it is in Cotton Valley sandstones from East Texas (0.8%) or Louisiana (1.6%) (Table 1). Abundant primary porosity (>10%) has been preserved in some Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi at temperatures as high as 266°F (130°C) and depths of 14,605 ft (4452 m) by the presence of continuous clay rims on detrital grains (Fig. 5) that inhibited quartz cementation.

Porosity measured by helium porosimeter represents total porosity, the sum of primary and secondary pores and micropores. Core-analysis porosity in Cotton Valley sandstones ranges from 0.6% to 23.8% and is higher in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi (average = 15.7%) than in East Texas (5.7%) and Louisiana (4.4%) (Table 1). Porosimeter porosity plotted versus depth for the three study areas shows that porosity is higher in some of the more deeply buried Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi than it is in the shallower sandstones from Texas and Louisiana (Fig. 8). This unusual trend of higher porosity at greater depth occurs because continuous clay rims on detrital grains in some Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi preserved intergranular porosity by inhibiting quartz cementation. Cotton Valley sandstones in Texas and Louisiana lack continuous clay rims and have been extensively cemented by quartz.

Micropores, defined as pores having pore-aperture radii <0.5 µm (Pittman, 1979), cannot be accurately quantified by routine thin-section point counts but can be estimated as the difference between porosimeter porosity and thin-section porosity. Average microporosity in Cotton Valley sandstones having <10% clay matrix is 3.5%. Microporosity in Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi averages 4.6%, compared with 4.4% in East Texas and 1.7% in Louisiana (Table 1).

Permeability Trends

Geometric-mean permeability measured on Cotton Valley core-plug samples is 0.05 md and ranges from 0.001 to 356 md. Mean permeability is higher in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi (7.3 md) than it is in sandstones from East Texas (0.02 md) or Louisiana (0.06 md) (Table 1). A plot of permeability versus temperature indicates that the hottest Cotton Valley samples (>330°F [>165°C]), which are from Louisiana, all have low permeability, but samples at temperatures from 230 to 280°F (110 to 138°C) have a wide range of permeabilities (Fig. 9).

The high permeability sandstones in Mississippi are from the Shell #1 Fender (Ambrose et al., 2017, this volume), the Shell #2 Fender, and the Southwest Gas #1 Richardson wells (Fig. 1). Sandstones from these cores are interpreted as having been deposited in both fluvial-channel and shoreface depositional environments. These sandstones have chlorite and illite clay rims that preserved intergranular porosity by inhibiting quartz cementation. Volume of quartz cement in these cores ranges from 0 to 11.5%. In contrast, sandstones from the Pan American #1 Williamsoon well in Mississippi (Fig. 1) have generally small, discontinuous clay rims, more abundant quartz cement (12 to 21%), and lower permeability. These sandstones were deposited in fluvial-channel environments (Ambrose et al., 2017, this volume).

Cotton Valley sandstones from East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi each have different porosity-permeability relationships (Fig. 10). The sandstones from East Texas and Louisiana have uniformly low porosity and permeability, whereas those from Mississippi show a wide range of porosity and permeability (Fig. 10). The reason for the two different permeability populations in Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi is not clear. Continuous clay rims that inhibited quartz cementation occur in both fluvial and shoreface sandstones, so the difference does not appear to be related to depositional environment. However, the low-permeability sandstones in the #1 Williamson core are interpreted as being Tithonian in age (early Cotton Valley), whereas the higher permeability sandstones in the #1 and #2 Fender and #1 Southwest Gas cores are interpreted as being Tithonian to Berriasian in age (late Cotton Valley). Differences in provenance between early and late Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi may account for the difference in abundance of clay rims. The age of the Cotton Valley sandstones studied by Thomas et al. (2004) in Mississippi was not stated, but they attributed the abundance of clay rims in Mississippi to a different provenance than the Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana.

Rock Strength

Data on unconfined compressive strength (UCS), Poisson’s Ratio, and Young’s Modulus of reservoir sandstones and overlying and underlying mudstone layers can be used to help predict vertical hydraulic fracture growth in low-permeability gas reservoirs (CER Corporation and S. A. Holditch & Associates, 1991). UCS of Cotton Valley sandstones and mudstones was estimated in this study using a rebound hammer, which measures...
Figure 8. Core-analysis porosity versus depth in Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi. Some deep sandstones in Mississippi have high porosity because continuous clay rims on detrital grains preserved intergranular porosity by inhibiting quartz cementation.

Figure 9. Core-analysis permeability versus temperature in Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi.
the rebound of a metallic anvil after it strikes a flat core surface (Kompatscher, 2004). Electronic sensors measure the velocity of the anvil as it travels toward and away from the surface of the sample. The rebound hammer records a value of hardness for the material struck known as Leeb Hardness (HLD), which is the ratio of the rebound velocity \(v_r\) to the impact velocity \(v_i\), multiplied by 100 (Kompatscher, 2004). Leeb Hardness measurements acquired by the rebound hammer have been correlated with unconfined compressive strength (UCS) (Zahm and Enderlin, 2010). Leeb Hardness is converted to UCS by the following equation:

\[
\text{UCS (in megapascals [MPa])} = 0.000000683 \times \text{HLD}^{2.9} \quad \text{(Zahm and Enderlin, 2010)}.
\]

UCS is the uniaxial strength of a rock sample when pressed in a single direction from an applied force. The conventional method of measuring UCS is by the unconfined compression test (UCT). UCTs are conducted by placing core samples between two plates, one stationary and another that is lowered with a measured force. Core samples are compressed until the sample’s strength is overcome (the sample is unable to rebound elastically), and the core breaks (Nazir et al., 2013). The advantages of using the rebound hammer to estimate rock strength instead of the unconfined compression test are (1) it is non-destructive, (2) it is inexpensive, and (3) samples can be collected at high resolution, on a scale of centimeters (Zahm and Enderlin, 2010). The drawback is that UCS is not measured directly but is estimated by a correlation between UCS and Leeb Hardness. Measurement of Leeb Hardness by rebound hammer is sensitive to sample volume (Verwall and Mulder, 1993; Brooks et al., 2016). In small core samples having volumes less than 12 in\(^3\) (197 cm\(^3\)), UCS estimated from Leeb Hardness values is lower than values of USC measured by the unconfined compression test (Brooks et al., 2016).

UCS was measured every 0.5 ft (0.15 m) on Cotton Valley cores from Texas (Mobil #15 Cargill well), Louisiana (Sun #1–A Olinkraft, Amoco #1 Davis, and Amoco #1 Crown Zellerbach wells), and Mississippi (Shell #1 Fender, Pan American #1 Williamson, and Southwest Gas #1 Richardson wells) (Fig. 1). The objective of this investigation was to test if rebound hammer data can be correlated to variations in rock composition determined by thin-section point counts.

UCS values measured on Cotton Valley cores range from <1450 to >36,200 psi (<10 to >250 MPa) (Fig. 11). For samples with accompanying thin-section point count data, UCS in Cotton Valley mudstones ranges from (2750 to 14,200 psi [19 to 98 MPa]). Muddy sandstones with abundant clay matrix (>20% whole-rock volume) have UCS values of 5080 to 19,900 psi (35 to 137 MPa). UCS values in tightly cemented Cotton Valley sandstones in Texas and Louisiana are higher, ranging from 11,900 to 34,400 psi (82 to 237 MPa). UCS in low-permeability Cotton Valley sandstones from the Pan American #1 Richardson well in Smith County, Mississippi, ranges from 3340 to 22,300 psi (23 to 154 MPa), whereas UCS in the higher permeability sandstones from the Shell #1 Fender and the Southwest Gas #1 Richardson wells in Jasper County, Mississippi, ranges from 3920 to 13,100 psi (27 to 90 MPa).

There is a statistically significant correlation between total volume of cement in Cotton Valley samples and UCS (Fig. 12). Samples with low volumes of authigenic cement—either shales or porous sandstones—have low values of UCS. When struck by the rebound hammer, these ‘soft’ lithologies have slow...
rebound velocities and low calculated values of Leeb Hardness and UCS. Cotton Valley sandstones that are tightly cemented have a higher rebound velocity and high calculated values of Leeb Hardness and UCS. Positive correlation between cement volume and UCS was previously documented in sandstones of the Upper Cretaceous Woodbine Group in East Texas (Horodecky, 2015).

Cotton Valley sandstones that are tightly cemented by quartz have higher values of UCS than sandstones tightly cemented by carbonates (calcite and ankerite). Cotton Valley sandstones that contain ≥10% quartz cement (average = 15.3%) have average UCS of 26,100 psi (180 MPa). In contrast, Cotton Valley sandstones that contain ≥20% carbonate cement (average = 20.0%) have average UCS of 18,900 psi (130 MPa). The higher UCS in quartz-cemented sandstones might be explained by a stronger bond between detrital quartz grains and quartz overgrowths than between detrital quartz grains and carbonate cement.

### Burial-History Modeling

Burial-history models were prepared for representative wells in onshore East Texas, Louisiana, and Mississippi (Fig. 13) using a 1D thermal model. The models for the Mobil #15 Cargill well in East Texas and the Amoco #1 Davis well in Louisiana were calibrated with measured vitrinite reflectance values (Ro) (Dutton, 1987; Rushing et al., 2004; Goddard et al., 2008), but no measured Ro values were available for the Shell #1 Fender well in Mississippi (Fig. 1). The models calculated values of vitrinite reflectance equivalent (Roe) of Cotton Valley sandstones from time-temperature history using the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (LLNL) model (Sweeney and Burnham, 1990) (Table 2). Roe values in Table 2 are reported for an intermediate depth within the cored interval of each modeled well.

Roe values in onshore Cotton Valley sandstones decrease from west to east, even though burial depth increases (Table 2). Cotton Valley sandstones at 9280 ft (2828 m) in the Mobil #15 Cargill well in East Texas have a calculated Roe of 1.4%, and those in the Amoco #1 Davis well in Louisiana at a depth of 11,410 ft (3477 m) have a calculated Roe of 1.2% (Table 2). In contrast, Cotton Valley sandstones at 14,590 ft (4447 m) in the Shell #1 Fender well in Mississippi have calculated Roe of 1.05%. The reason for the lower thermal maturity of Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi than in East Texas and Louisiana is because the geothermal gradient increases from 1.4°F/100 ft (26°C/km) in Mississippi to 1.9°F/100 ft (35°C/km) in Louisiana and 2.0°F/100 ft (36°C/km) in East Texas (Table 2). Geothermal gradient generally increases from east to west along the northern Gulf of Mexico Coast and from offshore to onshore (DeFord et al., 1976; Blackwell and Richards, 2004; Nagihara and Jones, 2005; Forrest et al., 2005). The differences in burial- and thermal-history explain in part the greater volumes of quartz cement that precipitated in Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana than in Mississippi. Because of the variation in geothermal gradient across the study area, it is more appropriate to plot parameters in the study against temperature and not depth.

A burial-history model was also prepared for Cotton Valley sandstones in the Exxon #1 SL 00624 well in offshore Baldwin County, Alabama (Fig. 1), to compare Roe in onshore and offshore Cotton Valley sandstones. The model was calibrated with measured Ro data published by Rice et al. (1997). Cotton Valley sandstones in this well on the northeastern Gulf of Mexico shelf are buried to depths of 16,300 to 18,900 ft (4968 to 5760 m). The Roe values of 1.45 to 1.9% are significantly higher than those of onshore Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi.
DISCUSSION

Predicting the Presence of Clay Rims

Cotton Valley sandstones provide another example in which early clay rims on detrital grains preserve reservoir quality in sandstones. Previous petrographic studies of Cotton Valley sandstones reported the presence of chlorite rims on detrital grains in southern Mississippi (Janks et al., 1985) and offshore Viosca Knoll block 251 (Thomas et al., 2004, 2005). This study of Cotton Valley sandstones from central Mississippi also identified samples with abundant, continuous chlorite and illite grain rims that preserved good intergranular porosity by inhibiting quartz cementation. In contrast, Cotton Valley sandstones from East Texas and Louisiana contain fewer, and more discontinuous, clay rims and have poor reservoir quality.

It would be difficult to predict in advance of any petrographic work that Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi developed clay rims that were sufficiently abundant and continuous to preserve reservoir quality, whereas those in East Texas and Louisiana did not. The provenance of Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi does not contain ultrabasic volcanic rocks, which was the source of the abundant chlorite cement in Cretaceous Tuscaloosa sandstones in Louisiana (Thomson, 1979). However, Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi were derived from the Appalachian Mountains (Moore, 1983; Ewing, 2001; Thomas et al., 2004), a different source area than that of Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana, which were derived from the Ouachita Mountains and Arbuckle Uplift (Coleman, 1985; Wescott, 1983, 1985; Ewing, 2001; Elshayeb, 2004). Metamorphic rock fragments are more abundant in Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi than those in East Texas and Louisiana. We agree with the conclusion of Thomas et al. (2004, 2005), that the difference in source areas for Cotton Valley sandstones deposited in the eastern versus western parts of the study area apparently resulted in differences in clay-rim coverage. The development of continuous clay rims in sandstone formations cannot yet be confidently predicted prior to petrographic analysis. However, because differences in provenance can lead to differences in clay-rim formation and reservoir quality, it is important to be alert to that possibility when reservoir-quality studies are initiated and to integrate reservoir-quality and basin-analysis studies.

Cotton Valley Sandstones, Northeastern Gulf of Mexico

Cotton Valley sandstones deposited in shallow-marine environments are exploration targets in the northeast Gulf of Mexico, offshore from Mississippi, Alabama, and Florida (Thomas et al., 2005; Petty, 2008). There is currently no production from these offshore Cotton Valley sandstones, although there have been gas shows in Cotton Valley clastics and carbonates in the Mississippi Sound, Mobile, Viosca Knoll, and Main Pass areas (Petty, 2008). Cotton Valley sandstones have not been detected in the northwestern Gulf of Mexico, offshore from Texas and Louisiana; in that area, the Tithonian interval consists of fine-grained, basinal deposits of the Bossier Formation (Salvador, 1991).

Cotton Valley sandstones cored in the Viosca Knoll 251 #1 well at a depth of 20,500 ft (6248 m) were deposited in a shoreface environment (Thomas et al., 2004). Measured core-analysis porosity in this well is 1.0 to 6.7%; porosity derived from log analysis ranges from 1 to 14% (Thomas et al., 2004). This porosity is significantly lower than Cotton Valley sandstones from onshore Mississippi, which ranges from 4.5 to 10.0%.
23.8%. Chlorite cement is present in the Viosca Knoll sandstones, which were derived from the Appalachian Mountains, but chlorite-coat coverage averages only 30% (Thomas et al., 2004).

Reservoir-quality modeling of the Viosca Knoll 251 #1 Cotton Valley sandstones indicates that intervals with only moderate chlorite-coat coverage will have low porosity because of extensive quartz cementation at these depths and temperatures (Thomas et al., 2004). However, modeling indicates that if grain-coating chlorite were extensive, reservoir quality could be preserved (Thomas et al., 2004). Thermal maturity was not calculated for this well, but because of the greater burial depth it is likely higher than that of Cotton Valley sandstones in the Exxon #1 SL 00624 well, where \( R_{oe} \) is 1.9% at a depth of 18,900 ft (5760 m). Thus, despite the presence of some chlorite coats, low porosity values and high thermal maturity suggest that reservoir quality is generally poor in offshore Cotton Valley sandstones.

### CONCLUSIONS

Reservoir quality in onshore Cotton Valley sandstones varies significantly across the northern Gulf of Mexico Basin, increasing from East Texas to Mississippi. Core-analysis porosity in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi averages 15.7%, compared with 5.7% in East Texas and 4.4% in Louisiana. Geometric mean permeability is 7.3 md in Cotton Valley sandstones from Mississippi, but only 0.02 md in East Texas and 0.06 md in Louisiana.

The increase in porosity and permeability from west to east resulted from a combination of factors: (1) coarser grain size, (2) more continuous clay rims on detrital grains, and (3) lower geothermal gradient. Mean grain size of Cotton Valley sandstones is 3.5 phi (0.088 mm) in East Texas, 2.76 phi (0.148 mm) in Louisiana, and 2.22 phi (0.214 mm) in Mississippi. Most grains in Cotton Valley sandstones in East Texas and Louisiana lack clay rims, and clay coverage is estimated as less than 30% on grains that do have partial rims. Abundant quartz cement precipitated where clay-rim coverage was low. In contrast, more grains in Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi contain clay rims, and coverage on some grains is estimated as >70%. The clay rims inhibited later quartz cementation and preserved intergranular porosity. UCS of Cotton Valley sandstones is highest in tightly quartz-cemented samples from East Texas and Louisiana.

Cotton Valley reservoir sandstones at 9280 ft (2829 m) in East Texas have \( R_{oe} \) of 1.4%, and those in Louisiana at a depth of 11,410 ft (3478 m) have \( R_{oe} \) of 1.2%. In contrast, Cotton Valley sandstones at 14,590 ft (4447 m) in Mississippi have \( R_{oe} \) of 1.05%. The reason for the lower thermal maturity of Cotton Valley sandstones in Mississippi than in East Texas and Louisiana is because the geothermal gradient increases from 1.4°F/100 ft in Mississippi to 1.9°F/100 ft in Louisiana and 2.0°F/100 ft in East Texas. Low porosity and high thermal maturity in offshore Cotton Valley sandstones in the northeastern Gulf of Mexico indicate that generally poor reservoir quality exists in this area.

### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was funded by member companies of the Deep Reservoir Quality consortium at the Bureau of Economic Geology, University of Texas at Austin. Student research assistants April Bievenour and Taylor Childers provided valuable help in
all aspects of the study, including grain-size point counts of Cotton Valley thin sections. Patrick Smith of the Bureau of Economic Geology prepared SEM samples and ran the SEM. Figures were drafted by the media department staff of the Bureau of Economic Geology under the direction of Cathy Brown, media department manager. We thank Ruarri Day-STirrat, Andrew Thomas, Associate Editor Ling Gao, Editor Barry Katz, and Managing Editor James Willis for providing thorough and constructive reviews that improved this paper. Publication authorized by the Director, Bureau of Economic Geology, University of Texas at Austin.

REFERENCES CITED


